STATE OF VERMONT PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Case No. 23-1860-INV

2023 standard-offer prices for existing
hydroelectric plants with a nameplate capacity
of 5 MW or less and farm methane plants

Order entered: 08/08/2023

ORDER - 2023 STANDARD-OFFER PRICES FOR EXISTING Hydroelectric Plants And Farm Methane Plants

In this Order, the Vermont Public Utility Commission ("Commission") adopts the conclusions and recommendations made in the Hearing Officer's proposal for decision. The proposal for decision was circulated to the parties. The parties' comments and our determinations are addressed in the Commission discussion and conclusions section below.

PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

I. INTRODUCTION

The Commission is required annually to determine the price elements for use in standardoffer contracts for existing hydroelectric plants. In this proposal for decision, I recommend recalculating and adjusting the price elements for energy, capacity, and environmental attributes, and I recommend no adjustments to the price elements for avoided line losses and the value of a long-term contract.

The Commission is also required annually to establish prices for farm methane projects. In this proposal for decision, I recommend prices for small and large farm methane projects.

II. <u>BACKGROUND</u>

The Commission establishes the standard-offer price for existing hydroelectric plants less than or equal to 5 MW in nameplate capacity using the sum of five elements identified in statute.¹

The five elements of the standard-offer price are: (1) the two-year rolling average of the ISO New England Vermont zone hourly locational marginal price for energy; (2) the two-year rolling average of the value of the plant's capacity in the ISO New England Forward Capacity

¹ 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(p)(3).

Market; (3) the value of avoided line losses; (4) the two-year rolling average of the market value of environmental attributes, including renewable energy credits; and (5) the value of a 10- or 20-year contract.²

The Commission is required annually to recalculate and adjust the price elements of energy, capacity, and environmental attributes for all executed contracts.³ The Commission may also periodically adjust the value of environmental attributes of an executed contract based upon whether the unit becomes certified by the Low-Impact Hydropower Institute of Portland, Maine ("LIHI") or loses such certification.⁴

The price elements of avoided line losses and the value of a long-term contract remain fixed at their values at the time a contract is signed for the duration of an executed contract. The Commission may annually adjust the two elements for inclusion in future executed contracts.⁵ Pursuant to Section 8005a(f)(3), the Commission is required to annually review the prices under the standard-offer program.

According to Section 8005a(g), farm methane projects remain outside of the programmatic cap (i.e., no restrictions on the number of projects that can participate in the program). As part of an annual review under Section 8005a(f)(3), the Commission determines the prices that will be used for farm methane projects under the standard-offer program.

III. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

A. Existing Hydroelectric Plants

Energy, Capacity, and Environmental Attributes

Consistent with statutory requirements, in previous Orders the Commission established methodologies to annually recalculate and adjust the price elements of energy, capacity, and

² 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(p)(3)(A) through (E).

³ 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(p)(4)(A)(i).

 $^{^4}$ 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(p)(4)(A)(ii). LIHI is a not-for-profit 501(c)(3) organization dedicated to reducing the impacts of hydroelectric generation through the certification of hydroelectric projects that have avoided or reduced their environmental impacts pursuant to LIHI's criteria. To be LIHI-certified, a hydroelectric facility must meet criteria in the following eight areas: river flows, water quality, fish passage and protection, watershed protection, threatened and endangered species protection, cultural resource protection, recreation, and facilities recommended for removal.

⁵ 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(p)(4)(B)(ii).

environmental attributes.⁶

I recommend that the 2023 energy price element be 6.39 cents per kWh. This value is calculated using the two-year rolling average of the ISO New England Vermont zone hourly real-time locational marginal price for calendar years 2021 and 2022.

I recommend that the 2023 capacity price element be \$4.22 per kW-month. This value is calculated based upon the two-year average payment rate for the Forward Capacity Auction 2021-2022 results and 2022-2023 results. Consistent with past determinations, for units that serve as load reducers, I recommend that a 15% adder be made to the capacity revenue value to reflect that the unit is reducing the utility's capacity reserve requirement. Thus, the total amount paid for capacity each month will be the capacity price element multiplied by the ISO New England Forward Capacity Market-qualified winter and summer capacity ratings for the hydroelectric plant, adjusted further by the contract adder. If the plant is a load-reducer, the capacity rating is its generation at the time of the ISO New England peak for the previous two years.

The price element reflecting the value for environmental attributes is determined based on the renewable energy credits for which an existing hydroelectric plant qualifies. Existing hydroelectric plants eligible for the standard-offer program may qualify for one of three categories of renewable energy credits: Massachusetts Class II, Connecticut Class I, and Maine Existing. The price element value for each category of renewable energy credit is determined using the two-year average prices. The two-year average prices represent the two-year rolling average of the market value of environmental attributes, consistent with the statutory requirements of Section 8005a(p)(3)(D). The Standard Offer Facilitator submits an annual filing of the broker data used to determine these values.⁷ Accordingly, for use in 2023 standard-offer contracts, I recommend that a plant qualifying for Massachusetts Class II renewable energy credits receive a price element value of 2.54 cents/kWh, a plant qualifying for Connecticut Class I renewable energy credits receive a price element value of 3.73 cents/kWh, and a plant qualifying for Maine Existing renewable energy credits receive a price element value of 0.77

⁶ See Docket 7874, Order of 3/6/15; Docket 7874, Order of 4/18/16; Case No. 17-3148-INV, Order of 5/25/17; Case No. 17-3148-INV, Order of 3/13/18; Case No. 18-0360-INV, Order of 9/17/19; Case No. 21-1090-INV, Order of 3/16/21; and Case No. 22-0829-INV, Order of 3/16/22.

⁷ See Case No. 23A-0723.

cents/kWh.

Avoided Line Losses and Value of Long-Term Contract

With respect to the price elements addressing avoided line losses and the value of longterm contracts, the Commission is not required to annually revise its previously determined values for the two price elements. The Commission recently completed a review of these price elements in 2021.⁸ It is my understanding that no existing hydroelectric plants are likely to seek a standard-offer contract for 2023. Thus, I recommend that the Commission find that a review of these price elements for use in 2023 standard-offer contracts is not needed and make no revisions to these price elements.

Accordingly, I recommend that the value for the price element addressing avoided line losses is either 3% or 5% of the sum of the value of the energy and capacity elements. If there is one transformation (from 115 kV to interconnection voltage), then the losses are assumed to be 3%. If there is an additional transformation (from sub-transmission voltage to interconnection voltage), then the losses are assumed to be 5%.⁹ In addition, I recommend that the price element reflecting the value of a long-term contract is a 1% adder to the value of the energy and capacity components of the price for 10-year contracts and a 2% adder for 20-year contracts.¹⁰

B. Farm Methane Plants

According to Section 8005a(g), farm methane projects remain outside the standard-offer program's cumulative plant capacity amount of 127.5 MW, and these projects may request a standard-offer contract at any time. The Commission established a process to fold the review of farm methane prices into the annual proceeding to update the prices available to existing hydroelectric facilities under 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(p)(4).¹¹

For 2023, no participant requested a review of the prices for farm methane projects. I recommend that the Commission adopt the 2022 prices for use in 2023. Accordingly, I recommend that the Commission establish a price of \$0.145 per kWh, fixed over the term of the

⁸ See Case No. 21-1090-INV, Order of 12/14/21.

⁹ See Docket 7874, Order of 3/6/15; Docket 7874, Order of 4/18/16; Case No. 17-3148-INV, Order of 5/25/17; Case No. 17-3148-INV, Order of 3/13/18; Case No. 18-0360-INV, Order of 9/17/19; and Case No. 21-1090-INV, Order of 12/14/21.

¹⁰ See Case No. 18-0360-INV, Order of 9/17/19; Case No. 21-1090-INV, Order of 12/14/21; and Case No. 22-0829-INV, Order of 3/16/22.

¹¹ See Case 21-4085-INV, Order of 2/15/22 at 10.

20-year contract, for large farm methane projects, and a price of \$0.199 per kWh, fixed over the term of the 20-year contract, for small farm methane projects.¹² The large farm methane category includes projects with a nameplate capacity greater than 150 kW, and the small farm methane category includes projects with a nameplate capacity less than or equal to 150 kW.

C. Recommendations for Statutory Changes

As part of this proposal for decision, I am seeking comment on whether the Commission should recommend statutory changes to Section 8005a(p)(4) to the Vermont Legislature. My concern is that the Commission and other stakeholders are expending resources when there currently are no existing hydroelectric plants eligible to take a standard-offer contract. That is, any eligible plant has already taken a contract under other programs, including the net-metering program and Commission Rule 4.100.

As part of comments on this proposal for decision, I ask the participants to address whether there is a need for a standard-offer program for existing hydroelectric units and whether the Commission should recommend that the Vermont Legislature sunset Section 8005a(p)(4).

In addition, I am seeking comment on whether the Commission should recommend statutory changes to Section 8005a(g). Farm methane projects remain outside the cumulative plant capacity, and the Commission is required to conduct an annual review of farm methane prices. In the last several years, no farm methane projects have sought a standard-offer contract. My concern is that the Commission and other stakeholders are expending resources annually to establish prices when there is no interest in projects accepting a standard-offer project.

As part of comments on this proposal for decision, I ask the participants to address whether farm methane prices should be reviewed on annual basis and whether the Commission should recommend changes to Section 8005a(g) to allow prices to be reviewed on a less frequent basis (e.g., on a five-year basis or at the request of a stakeholder). Between reviews, the standard-offer price most recently established would remain in place. In addition, I ask the participants to address whether a standard-offer program for farm methane projects is needed.

¹² See Case No. 19-4466-INV, Order of 06/11/2020; Case No. 20-2935-INV, Order of 4/26/21; and Case 21-4085-INV, Order of 2/15/22.

IV. CONCLUSION

In this proposal for decision, I make recommendations for the price elements for use in any 2023 standard-offer contracts for existing hydroelectric plants. In addition, I recommend prices for small and large farm methane projects. Finally, I seek comments from stakeholders on whether any statutory changes concerning the current price determination requirements are advisable.

This proposal for decision is being served on all parties to this proceeding in accordance with 3 V.S.A. § 811.

Mary Jo Krolewski

Mary Jo Krolewski Hearing Officer

V. COMMISSION DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

The Department filed comments stating that it had no objections to the prices established in the proposal for decision. With respect to possible statutory changes, the Department asserts that the option for future standard-offer hydroelectric or farm methane facilities may yet benefit Vermont. The Department does not oppose statutory changes that would allow less-frequent price updates, such as upon a request to participate in the program, to minimize the administrative burden of the program. No party recommended removing either hydroelectric plants or farm methane projects from the standard-offer program.

Based on our review of the proposal for decision and the Department's comments, we adopt the recommendations and conclusions of the Hearing Officer regarding the standard-offer price elements for existing hydroelectric plants and the prices for farm methane projects after March 1, 2023. The Commission will consider proposing potential statutory changes that would preserve the benefits of the program while reducing its administrative burden. If the Commission develops draft statutory changes, the Commission will circulate the potential language to the Department and stakeholders before presenting a proposal to the Vermont Legislature.

VI. ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED by the Vermont Public Utility Commission ("Commission") that:

1. Effective for any standard-offer contract executed after the issuance of this Order for existing hydroelectric plants under 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(p), the standard-offer price elements for energy, capacity, environmental attributes, avoided line losses, and the value of long-term contracts shall be as determined in this Order.

2. Effective for any standard-offer contract executed after March 1, 2023, pursuant to 30 V.S.A. § 8005a(f)(2), the following will serve as the prices for farm methane projects under the standard-offer program: (1) \$0.145 per kWh fixed over the 20-year contract for projects with a nameplate capacity greater than 150 kW; and (2) \$0.199 per kWh fixed over the 20-year contract for projects with a nameplate capacity less than or equal to 150 kW.

Dated at Montpelier, Vermont, this	8th day of August, 202	
19) Anthony Z. Roisman)	Public Utility
- Pan) out ching)	Commission
I I	Vargaret Cheney)	
	Riley Allen)	OF VERMONT

OFFICE OF THE CLERK

Filed: August 8, 2023 Attest: Clerk of the Commission

Notice to Readers: This decision is subject to revision of technical errors. Readers are requested to notify the Clerk of the Commission (by e-mail, telephone, or in writing) of any apparent errors, in order that any necessary corrections may be made. (E-mail address: puc.clerk@vermont.gov)

Appeal of this decision to the Supreme Court of Vermont must be filed with the Clerk of the Commission within 30 days. Appeal will not stay the effect of this Order, absent further order by this Commission or appropriate action by the Supreme Court of Vermont. Motions for reconsideration or stay, if any, must be filed with the Clerk of the Commission within 28 days of the date of this decision and Order.

PUC Case No. 23-1860-INV - SERVICE LIST

Carolyn M.X. Alderman, Esq. VEPP Inc. P.O. Box 1938 Manchester Center, VT 05255 carolyn@veppi.org

Erik Bailey Village of Johnson Water & Light Department PO Box 603 Johnson, VT 05656 ebailey@townofjohnson.com

Sarah Braese Vermont Public Power Supply Authority PO Box 126 5195 Waterbury-Stowe Road Waterbury Center, VT 05677 sbraese@vppsa.com

Victoria J. Brown, Esq. Vermont Electric Cooperative, Inc. 42 Wescom Road Johnson, VT 05656 vbrown@vermontelectric.coop

Jeffrey Cram GF Power LLC 1000 River Street Essex Junction, VT 05452 jeffrey.cram@globalfoundries.com

Crystal L Currier Vermont Public Power Supply Authority PO Box 126 Waterbury Center, VT 05677 ccurrier@vppsa.com

William F. Ellis McNeil, Leddy & Sheahan 271 South Union Street Burlington, VT 05401 wellis@mcneilvt.com (for VEPP Inc.)

(for Village of Johnson Water & Light Department)

(for Vermont Public Power Supply Authority)

(for Vermont Electric Cooperative Inc.)

(for GF Power LLC)

(for Barton Village Inc. Electric Department)

(for City of Burlington Electric Department) Jonathan Elwell Village of Lyndonville Electric Department PO Box 167 20 Park Avenue Lyndonville, VT 05851 jelwell@lyndonvilleelectric.com

Elijah D Emerson, Esq. Primmer Piper Eggleston & Cramer PC PO Box 1309 Montpelier, VT 05601 eemerson@primmer.com

Marla Emery Village of Johnson Water & Light Department P.O. Box 603 Johnson, VT 05656 memery@townofjohnson.com

Brian Evans-Mongeon Village of Hyde Park Electric Department gm@villageofhydepark.com

Steven R Farman Vermont Public Power Supply Authority 5195 Waterbury-Stowe rd Waterbury Center, VT 05766 sfarman@vppsa.com

Karen Field Town of Hardwick Electric Department PO Box 516 Hardwick, VT 05843 kfield@hardwickelectric.com

James Gibbons City of Burlington Electric Department 585 Pine Street Burlington, VT 05401 jgibbons@burlingtonelectric.com (for Village of Lyndonville Electric Department)

(for Village of Johnson Water & Light Department) (for Town of Northfield Electric Department) (for Village of Enosburg Falls Water & Light Department Inc.) (for Town of Hardwick Electric Department) (for Village of Johnson Water & Light Department)

(for Village of Hyde Park Electric Department)

(for Vermont Public Power Supply Authority)

(for Town of Hardwick Electric Department)

(for City of Burlington Electric Department) Grace Grundhauser Green Mountain Power Corporation 163 Acorn Lane Colchester, VT 05446 grace.grundhauser@greenmountainpower.com

Michael J. Hall Stackpole & French Law Offices PO Box 819 Stowe, VT 05672 mhall@stackpolefrench.com

Scott Johnstone Village of Morrisville Water & Light Department 857 Elmore Street Morrisville, VT 05661 sjohnstone@mwlvt.com

Michael Lazorchak Town of Stowe Electric Department PO Box 190 Stowe, VT 05672 mlazorchak@stoweelectric.com

Mari McClure Green Mountain Power Corporation 163 Acorn Lane Colchester, VT 05446 ceo@greenmountainpower.com

Abbey Miller Village of Enosburg Falls Water & Light Department 42 Village Drive Enosburg Falls, VT 05450 amiller@enosburg.net

Liz Miller Green Mountain Power 163 Acorn Lane Colchester, VT 05446 Liz.Miller@greenmountainpower.com (for Green Mountain Power Corporation)

(for Town of Stowe Electric Department)

(for Village of Morrisville Water & Light Department)

(for Town of Stowe Electric Department)

(for Green Mountain Power Corporation)

(for Village of Enosburg Falls Water & Light Department Inc.)

(for Green Mountain Power Corporation) Pamela Moore Village of Jacksonville Electric Company P.O. Box 169 Jacksonville, VT 05342 sfarman@live.com

John Morley Village of Orleans Electric Department Municipal Building One Memorial Square Orleans, VT 05860 jmorley@villageoforleansvt.org

Ken Nolan Vermont Public Power Supply Authority P.O. Box 126 Waterbury Center, VT 05677 knolan@vppsa.com

Lynn Paradis Village of Swanton Village of Swanton 120 First St. Swanton, VT 05488 lparadis@swanton.net

Thomas Petraska Village of Ludlow Electric Light Department 9 Pond Street Ludlow, VT 05149 tpetraska@ludlowelectric.com

Louis Porter Washington Electric Cooperative PO Box 8 East Montpelier, VT 05651 louis.porter@wec.coop

Jackie Pratt Town of Stowe Electric Department PO Box 190 Stowe, VT 05672 jpratt@stoweelectric.com (for Village of Jacksonville Electric Company)

(for Village of Orleans Electric Department)

(for Vermont Public Power Supply Authority)

(for Swanton Village, Inc. Electric Department)

(for Village of Ludlow Electric Light Department)

(for Washington Electric Cooperative Inc.)

(for Town of Stowe Electric Department) Alexander Wing Vermont Department of Public Service 112 State Street Montpelier, VT 05620-2601 alexander.wing@vermont.gov

Jeffrey Schulz Town of Northfield Electric Department 51 South Main Street Northfield, VT 05663 jschulz@northfield.vt.us

William (Bill) Sheets Swanton Village, Inc. Electric Department 120 First Street Swanton, VT 05488 wsheets@swanton.net

Ronald A. Shems, Esq. Tarrant, Gillies & Shems, LLP P.O. Box 1440 Montpelier, VT 05601-1440 ron@tarrantgillies.com

Darren Springer City of Burlington Electric Department 585 Pine Street Burlington, VT 05401 dspringer@burlingtonelectric.com

Emily Stebbins-Wheelock City of Burlington Electric Department 585 Pine Street Burlington, VT 05401 estebbins-wheelock@burlingtonelectric.com

Michael Sullivan Town of Hardwick Electric Department P.O. Box 516 Hardwick, VT 05843 msullivan@hardwickelectric.com (for Vermont Department of Public Service)

(for Town of Northfield Electric Department)

(for Swanton Village, Inc. Electric Department)

(for Washington Electric Cooperative Inc.)

(for City of Burlington Electric Department)

(for City of Burlington Electric Department)

(for Town of Hardwick Electric Department)

Rebecca Towne Vermont Electric Cooperative, Inc. 42 Wescom Road Johnson, VT 05656 rtowne@vermontelectric.coop

Meghan von Ballmoos VEPP, Inc. PO Box 1938 Manchester Center, VT 05255 meghan@veppi.org (for Vermont Electric Cooperative Inc.)

(for VEPP Inc.)